



THE AGA KHAN UNIVERSITY

eCommons@AKU

---

Institute for Educational Development, Karachi

Institute for Educational Development

---

December 2005

# Citizenship education in Pakistani schools: Problems and possibilities

Bernadette L. Dean

*Aga Khan University, Institute for Educational Development, Karachi*

Follow this and additional works at: [http://ecommons.aku.edu/pakistan\\_ied\\_pdck](http://ecommons.aku.edu/pakistan_ied_pdck)

---

## Recommended Citation

Dean, B. L. (2005). Citizenship education in Pakistani schools: Problems and possibilities. *International Journal of Citizenship and Teacher Education*, 1(2), 35-55.

**Available at:** [http://ecommons.aku.edu/pakistan\\_ied\\_pdck/30](http://ecommons.aku.edu/pakistan_ied_pdck/30)

## *Citizenship Education In Pakistani Schools: Problems And Possibilities*

BERNADETTE L. DEAN, *Aga Khan University, Institute for Educational Development*

**ABSTRACT** A critical aspect of education that is often overlooked or inadequately addressed is the preparation of school students for citizenship. This paper assesses the current state of citizenship education in Pakistani schools. It draws on the findings of two research studies: an analysis of the social studies curriculum and textbooks and a review of teaching and learning practices in schools. The findings indicate that the curriculum and textbooks do not distinguish between Islamic education and citizenship education and promotes exclusionary and passive citizenship. They also shows that while Pakistani students acquire knowledge and learn some important values in schools, they do not learn the skills (problem-solving, decision-making) and values (civic mindedness, critical consciousness) required for effective participation in democratic life. The paper finally suggests what a teacher education program should include if teachers are to prepare students for informed, responsible and participatory citizenship.

### **Introduction**

One of the most important goals of education is the preparation of young people for their role as citizens. The problem, however, is that many countries including Pakistan do not give citizenship education the importance it deserves, nor use approaches appropriate to the development of informed and participatory citizenship. (Dean, 2000; Kerr, McCarthy and Smith 2002; Torney-Purta and Amadeo 1999)

In 2002, the Aga Khan University, Institute for Educational Development (AKU-IED) became a partner in a Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) funded Citizenship Rights and Responsibilities Pakistan (CRRP) project. The Project aimed to improve citizenship education in Pakistani schools through the development of supplementary curriculum materials; the development of a cadre of teachers to educate for citizenship; and the formulation of a national citizenship education program in Pakistan.

Prior to the project the CRRP team at AKU-IED assessed the current state of citizenship education in schools. Two research studies: an analysis of the social studies curriculum and textbooks used in Pakistani schools and a review of teaching and learning practices in citizenship education were conducted. This paper shares the findings of these studies and suggests how citizenship education can be promoted through teacher education.

## BACKGROUND

Since its independence in 1947 Pakistan has had a distinct political transition every ten years. With each political transition a new education policy was developed. Each aimed to prepare ‘good citizens’ but instead, reproduced the government’s ideology and its conception of citizenship and citizenship education (Althusser 1972).

### The Pakistan Education Conference 1947

Pakistan was born in the aftermath of World War II, after a long struggle for freedom from colonial rule. After independence, Pakistan faced multifarious problems: communal conflict, language riots, and administering two dispersed territories. While dealing with the immediate problems, the government also addressed the long-term objectives of national development. One being the reorientation of the colonial education system “on the lines suited to the genius of our people, consonant with our history and culture and having regard for the modern conditions and vast developments that have taken place over the world” (Ministry of Interior (Education Division) 1947, p.5).

The educational system was entrusted the task of building a “modern democratic state” and educating citizens in “body, mind and character” to live a good life themselves and improve the lives of others. To accomplish this task, it would be “animated and guided” by the Islamic principles of “universal brotherhood of man [sic], social democracy and social justice” and the “democratic virtues of tolerance, self-help, self-sacrifice...”

Fazlur Rehman, then Education Minister explained that the aims of education in a democratic society must be holistic. He suggested that the sociopolitical element entail “training for citizenship.” He stated,

*The possession of a vote by a person ignorant of the privileges and responsibilities of citizenship... is responsible for endless corruption and political instability. Our education must ...[teach] the fundamental maxim of democracy, that the price of liberty is eternal vigilance and it must aim at cultivating the civil virtues of discipline, integrity, and unselfish public service.(Ministry of Interior (Education Division) 1947, p.8)*

He noted that education must serve to make all members of the body politic citizens of Pakistan, “no matter what political, religious or provincial label one may possess” (Ministry of Interior (Education Division) 1947, p.8). Thus, the educational conference envisioned an educational system that would prepare citizens with the knowledge and dispositions needed to create a democratic society.

### The Sharif Commission Report

In December 1958, the Martial Law Government of Ayub Khan appointed a Commission to develop a national education system. The commission identified two limitations in society which education should address: the lack of national unity as evidenced by passivity and non-cooperation in public affairs and the failure to make “technological progress.” (Ministry of Education, 1959, p.11)

To facilitate technological progress the policy suggested a differential education system. Education for leaders would focus on knowledge acquisition and character development; whereas that for a large skilled labour force would be vocational education. Thus, each stage became a terminal stage with educational institutions and opportunities decreasing at each higher stage. Rather than universal education, it emphasized quality education at the tertiary level in the belief that the economic benefits accruing would 'trickle down' to the poor. This did not happen and Pakistan has become one of the most illiterate and disparate nations in the world today.

To develop national unity a uniform school curriculum was developed and the government prescribed textbooks for classes 1-12. Religious education became compulsory at elementary school. History, geography and civics were merged to become social studies with citizenship education as its aim. The social studies was designed to teach students about the problems facing Pakistan, their rights and responsibilities and to act as useful and loyal citizens. (Ministry of Education, 1959)

### **The New Education Policy 1972-1980**

The education system radically changed direction after the Bhutto government was overthrown in a military coup in 1977. The Martial Law Government of General Zia-ul-Haq announced a new National Education policy in 1979. The policy aims were the Islamisation of society, and citizenship education the development of citizens as true practicing Muslims.

Fearing that the provinces of West Pakistan would follow East Pakistan, the aim of the education policy became to build "national cohesion by promoting social and cultural harmony". To achieve this aim the government decided to reduce societal inequality and encourage people's participation in the decision-making process. It took the radical step of nationalizing "all privately-managed schools and colleges" and encouraged "active participation" of citizens in the universalization of elementary education (Ministry of Education, 1972, pp. 6, 35). In addition, it set up a National Curriculum Bureau to revise the curriculum. It introduced Pakistan studies in classes 9 and 10 to develop patriotism and build national unity. These steps were important for citizenship as it called for people's participation in ensuring the rights of others and working together to build the nation.

### **National Education Policy and Implementation Program 1979**

The education system radically changed direction with the 1979 policy of the Martial Law Government of General Zia-ul-Haq. The policy aims were the Islamisation of society, and citizenship education the development of citizens as true practicing Muslims.

The "highest priority" was given to the revision of curricula so that "Islamic ideology permeates the thinking of the younger generation," and society is refashioned according to Islamic tenets (Ministry of Education, 1979, p.2). Separate "institutions" and "curricula" were prepared for female education related to the distinctive role assigned women in Islamic society (ibid. p.3). Islamiyat and Pakistan Studies were made compulsory at the undergraduate level. For the first time, there was a chapter entitled, "Education of the Citizen." The purpose of which was to "impart the teachings of Islam," to the uneducated masses to prepare them for "a clean, purposeful and productive life." (Ministry of Education, 1979, p.30)

Nowhere in the policy, are the Islamic values or the character and conduct of a true Muslim, explained. Because 96% of the people of Pakistan are Muslim the

assumption is that the ideology is part of the people's consciousness (Apple, 1990). But as Kazi (1991) points out it is important to make these values explicit, given the contradictory definitions of Islam among various sociocultural groups in Pakistan. Furthermore, the aims of education resemble the aims of Islamic education "reflecting in this respect a very narrow view held by a minority among Muslims that all education be that of Islamiyat" (Nayyar and Salim 2004, p.ii). The policy defines citizenship in exclusionary terms. It excludes non-Muslim Pakistanis from being Pakistani citizens, and women from equal citizenship by educating them for a different role.

### **The National Education Policy 1998-2010**

The aims of the National Education Policy (NEP) 1998-2010 are similar to the 1979 policy, that is, to create "a sound Islamic society" through education that serves as "an instrument for the spiritual development as well as the material fulfilment of human needs". To support this aim, it quoted the message of Pakistan's founder to the first Education Conference, where he defined the purpose of education as the development of the "future citizens of Pakistan". Citizens, he felt, should be provided education "to build up our future economic life" and "build up the character of our future generation" so that they would possess "the highest sense of honour, integrity, responsibility and selfless service to the nation." (National Education Policy, 1998-2010, p.5).

There are contradictions in the two positions. Jinnah envisaged Pakistan as a democracy in which all citizens are equal members of the state and the purpose of education, the development of all citizens of Pakistan. This policy views Pakistan as an Islamic state and defines citizenship in exclusionary terms. Moreover, while both view the purpose of education as the creation of productive and useful worker-citizens, Jinnah also emphasizes character education to prepare responsible and service-oriented citizens.

Nations make efforts to develop a national identity so that members of the state, despite being different share an identity and act in the interest of all. If Pakistan wants to create a democratic society, she must develop a sense of belonging among her citizens by emphasizing unity in diversity and treating all equitably as Jinnah envisioned. She will then be able to demand and receive contributions to development and prosperity from all her citizens.

## **RESEARCH METHODS**

### **Curriculum and textbook analysis**

The team examined the 2002 social studies curriculum to identify how the curriculum aims, organization and structure served citizenship education. To analyse the textbooks they developed a textbook analysis instrument based on the work of Grant and Sleeter (1991). It consists of seven different categories: illustration analysis, people mentioned analysis, language analysis, institutions analysis, storyline analysis and end-of-the-chapter exercise analysis.

Illustration analysis involves identifying who or what the illustration is about: the setting, the nature of the action, the message and any stereotyping. People are analysed to identify each person by age, sex, ethnic group and social class. Further, the reason for inclusion such as their role, whether alone or with others, the message

and stereotyping if any is identified. Institution analysis is used to identify the nature of the work, the processes used and values promoted by institutions. Language analysis involves the identification of words/sentences that are value laden, contain stereotypes, obscure viewpoints and convey citizenship related messages. Storyline analysis involves identification of the story being told, the main message of the story and what the author intends the reader to learn about. And finally the end-of-the-chapter exercise analysis seeks to identify the nature of the knowledge, skills and dispositions promoted.

We analyzed twenty social studies textbooks. The textbooks for classes III-VIII and the Pakistan studies text for classes IX and X (Sindh Textbook Board) prescribed for students studying in the Matriculation system; the social studies texts for classes I-V (Oxford University Press, Karachi) and geography and history texts for classes VI-VIII (Oxford University Press, Hong Kong) used by students studying in both the Matriculation and Cambridge systems; and the Environment of Pakistan (Peak Publishers) and Introduction to Pakistan studies (Caravan Book House) generally used in classes IX-X in the Cambridge system.

Each team member was assigned a set of textbooks for analysis. Each chapter in the textbook was read, the questions in each category systematically asked and answers noted down. When a book was completed a summary was prepared and discussed.

### **Review of citizenship education in schools**

All the eleven project schools were included in the research. The head teacher, and two teachers were selected through purposive sampling (taught social studies or a language (Urdu, English), who agreed to make a two year commitment and had not received formal training from AKU-IED).

A qualitative methodology and critical interpretive framework were utilized to gather data and guide the analysis (Cresswell 1997; Denzin and Lincoln 2002; Harder 1999; Bohman 2005; Habermas 1972). Data was collected through observation, semi-structured interviews and document analysis. To gather data two researchers spent two to three days in each participating school. They observed the school ethos, teaching and learning practices in the two teachers' classrooms and co-curricular activities. In addition, semi-structured interviews were conducted with the head teacher and the two teachers. Documents such as the teachers' timetables, lesson plans and minutes of the meetings of the School Management Committees were also collected. The critical interpretive framework was used to analyze the data and thereby understand the actions for citizenship education that teachers engaged in, explain the perspectives and conditions that underlie these actions and identify the actions needed to create alternatives.

### **The Social Studies Curriculum: Aims, Organization And Structure**

In Pakistan, citizenship education is integrated into the social studies. The aims, concepts, content, activities, learning outcomes and evaluation are provided in the national curriculum for social studies (see appendix A). The introduction to the curriculum emphasizes "developing [a] civic sense" through "traffic..., environment and population" education; "concepts of rights and responsibilities"; the skills of critical thinking within "the context of Islamic heritage"; problem solving; and the "promotion of the feeling of national integrity, cohesion and self reliance" (Ministry of Education, 2002, p. 5). The conceptual framework, aims and objectives are,

however directed towards ensuring the message of the Holy Quran is disseminated; true practicing Muslims are developed; Islamic ideology is accepted as the basis for Pakistan and foundation of national unity; social science knowledge that conforms to the moral, social and political framework of Islam is acquired and Islamic, moral and civic values inculcated.

To achieve the aims and objectives the curriculum focuses on knowledge acquisition. A significant portion of religious content is included, and from the large body of useful social studies instructional content a narrow body of content is selected (see appendix B). For example, though the land of Pakistan has a long history dating from the Indus Valley Civilization only content related to the independence movement especially the role of the Muslims is included. Another focus is the inculcation of a few values. Nearly every chapter in the primary curriculum includes an objective “develop respect for...” In class three alone, respect for: “dignity of labour and hard work”, “interdependence of fellow-beings”, “those who serve others”, and “important personalities” (Ministry of Education, 2002, pp.21-26) is developed.

The nature of the aims and objectives indicates that the curriculum makes no distinction between Islamic education and citizenship education. Social studies education must produce true practicing Muslims citizens who will work to strengthen the Islamic state. These objectives ignore the fact that there are non-Muslim students in social studies classrooms. Viewing Muslims as synonymous with Pakistan that it excludes religious minorities from being Pakistanis and serves division rather than national integration. The focus on factual knowledge and lack of skills means that students will know a lot of facts but not skills required for effective participation in democratic life. Although only the value of interdependence is specified other values important to citizenship are included in the curriculum. The curriculum, however, seeks to inculcate these values rather than helping students identify, develop to apply them in decision-making.

## THE TEXTBOOKS

Having specified the objectives, content and activities the curriculum is translated into textbooks by the provincial textbook boards. Schools are bound to use the government prescribed textbooks (the exception being a few private schools in which students study for the General Certificate of Education (GCE) of the Cambridge Board). Most teachers never see the curriculum; for them the textbook is the curriculum. The centrality of the textbook in citizenship education is the key motivation for its analysis.

The analysis provided below is drawn only from the eight textbooks published by the Sindh Textbook Board (STBB). This has been done because most students take the Matriculation examination. Also, the textbooks used for the GCE examination are not designed to educate for citizenship and therefore did not offer critical insights for citizenship education.

The language used in five of the eight textbooks serves to entrench biases against women, other nations, religious groups, and people with disabilities. The entire texts use the gendered words man and he, as neutral which makes males more dominant and perpetuates patriarchy. Loaded comparisons are used to differentiate between nations. For example, descriptions of Pakistan’s disputes with India (its traditional enemy) depict India as hostile and aggressive, whereas disputes with China (a traditional ally) are depicted as amicable. Positive adjectives and derogatory words are used in conjunction to project religious bias: the Hindus are cruel and unjust

while the Muslims are honest and virtuous. Generalizations such as reference to the Prophet of Islam as “Our Holy Prophet” ignore non-Muslim students who read the text and further inculcate religious bias. Texts also discriminate against people with disabilities: Centres for handicapped children “try to remove the physical and mental disability of these children so that they can become useful like their healthy counterparts” (Victor 1996, p.108). The use of the word “useful” implies that such children are useless to society. This is clearly a violation of their human rights and breeds prejudice!

The textbooks mainly deal with political and religious personalities, generally male, and from upper class backgrounds. Descriptions include facts about their lives, positive aspects of their personalities and the glorification of selected achievements. Moreover, these personalities are credited with single-handedly accomplishing the achievements for which they are famous. For example, the creation of Pakistan is attributed solely to Jinnah. Although meant to serve as role models for students, these personalities are defined unrealistically, hence students would find it impossible to emulate them. This fails to empower students to become change agents, because for them change can only be achieved by superhuman personalities.

Political, judicial, social and religious institutions at the local, national, regional and international levels are mentioned in the textbook. At the local and national level, governmental and charitable institutions are described. Civil society institutions involved in development and the promotion of human rights are not included. The texts provide factual details and principle functions of the institutions, but ignore their present performance. The exception is the United Nations whose inability to address the problems of the Muslim world is noted. Furthermore, government agency rather than citizen agency is promoted, disempowering students from creating a more just and peaceful society. Three texts that do create a sense of social responsibility focus mainly on environmental responsibility such as keeping one’s neighbourhood clean and reducing environmental pollution.

Relevant and appealing illustrations are imperative in facilitating learning. Only three of the eight textbooks have relevant illustrations. There is a glaring absence of illustrations in the other five textbooks. The textbook for class seven has only six illustrations in its one hundred and seven pages! The illustrations are limited to maps, which are often incomprehensible. As most of the personalities described are male, photographs are of men, thereby promoting gender inequality. Moreover, illustrations often reinforce gender stereotypes. In the class three textbook the chapter entitled ‘Professions’ has pictures of men as doctors, construction workers and farmers. The only picture of a woman is of a teacher, thereby reinforcing gender stereotypes regarding acceptable professions for women. While political leaders are depicted individually, average citizens appear in groups. Thus, reinforcing the belief that the people are less important than their representatives.

The storyline of the social studies textbooks conveys the following citizenship related messages to students:

- Pakistan is a democratic country. Democracy means rule by the people and is limited to voting in elections. In Pakistan it is not the people who have power but their representatives.
- Pakistan is an Islamic state. Islam is the religion and political ideology of Pakistan. The good Muslim is a good citizen. A good Muslim is a person who prays, fasts, gives alms to the poor and does one’s duties to Allah, one’s family and neighbours.

- We must be patriotic Pakistanis. Patriotism must be extended to the government in power. Since Pakistanis and Muslims are synonymous, our patriotism should be extended to the Muslim nation.
- Pakistan is culturally homogeneous. Pakistanis all share one culture as they have one religion, speak one language and dress in the same way.
- The government in power is the best government; the government is responsible for national development and it is addressing shortcomings.

Let me demonstrate how textbooks teach about democracy and good citizenship.

Most social studies texts begin with a simplistic definition of democracy. For example, the class six textbook states, “democracy means government of the people, by the people and for the people”. They subsequently point out that it is impossible for everyone to rule that is why “the government is run by a few representatives of the people”. They then explain the electoral process. Some texts promote elitist democracy as students learn democracy is a form of government in which “the elected representatives of the people enjoy the power to govern”. The texts discuss the rights of citizens in a democracy: the few mentioned are limited so stringently that one wonders if citizens actually do have rights. For example, “Every citizen has the right to enjoy freedom of speech and writing...No one has the right to express views as may lead to commotion or...which is against the country or which may lead to a civil riot” (Victor 1996, pp.101-104).

In its fifty-eight year history, Pakistan has been under military dictatorships for twenty-seven years. Texts, however, do not so much as explain what a dictatorship is. Instead students in class nine learn how various governments have amended the constitution, without studying the consequences of these changes.

To teach students to become good Muslims and, by extension, good citizens, the textbooks focus on pietistic and ritualistic Islam. Students learn that the best way to become a good Muslim is by praying, fasting, alms giving, filial piety and elderly esteem. Regarding prayer, the text reads, “The Holy Prophet (May the blessing and peace of Allah be upon him) said that performance of prayer is obligatory on every Muslim. The prayers help one become dutiful and honest. Prayers are instrumental in strengthening the bonds of Muslim unity and enables Muslims to resolve their economic, social and political problems by mutual interaction” (Ahmed et al 1998, p.4). The textbooks also focus on inculcating Islamic and moral values. Students learn worship only Allah; respect and be obedient to your parents; be polite to your elders; treat the younger with love and kindness; and treat your neighbours fairly.

The transformatory nature of Islam – its stress on equality of all human beings, its commands to act justly, its preferential option for the poor, its practice of tolerance, its emphasis on making informed judgements and its insistence that one resists to tyranny – are left out. (Esack 1997; Rahman 1986; Iqbal 1968). Similarly, the contributions of Syed Ahmed Khan and Muhammad Iqbal to reconstruct Islam in light of the sociopolitical realities facing Muslims in modern times are ignored.

The end-of-the-chapter exercises consist primarily of factual questions and fill in items. Thus they ensure students learn the text with its factual distortions, narrow interpretations, biases and prejudices. Three textbooks do include higher order questions, develop skills of inquiry, communication and problem-solving, and encourage students to act and reflect on their roles as citizens.

Textbook analysis indicate that while older textbooks serve to entrench biases and propagate prejudices. they also depict personalities as superhuman and focus on government rather than citizen agency. The three newer publications are generally free of these distortions and promote democratic citizenship education. However,

even these books must focus more on promoting gender equality and citizenship agency.

Citizenship education is broader than the formal curriculum. It includes what young people learn from the way schools are organized as well as teaching and learning in and outside the classroom. This paper now turns to assess the status of citizenship education in schools.

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN SCHOOLS

The schools in the study consisted of seven government and four private schools. Two of the private schools served low-income populations, one the middle class and one the upper-middle and upper class. The latter school was the only Cambridge school.

### Physical infrastructure

The government and low-income private schools lack adequate physical infrastructure. Classrooms are generally dirty, dull, and crammed with students. Following government directives a school admitted one hundred pre-primary students but due to lack of classrooms, seated them in the corridors. The head teacher's office usually serves as staffroom, sickroom, kitchen, and resource room. There are no toilets in some schools, whereas in others they are so filthy, it's a wonder they are used at all. The other two private schools are well resourced with large, clean and airy classrooms. In addition they have a library, science labs, computer labs and sick room facilities. All the private schools are built on small plots with little room for students to play. In two such schools students had to remain inside the building, even during recess. The government schools, however, have large playgrounds. One girls' school had no boundary wall, and people using the school grounds as a thoroughfare compromised the girls' security. After some young men persuaded two girls into leaving the school premises with them, students were no longer allowed to play in the grounds.

Schools had no or inadequate facilities of water and electricity. Despite Karachi's unbearable heat only one government school and two private schools had provision for drinking water for students. Classrooms had only one or two lights and fans for forty plus children. Karachi faces severe power shortages, thus during the many brownouts students work in hot, dark rooms.

Most government and low-income private schools have minimal teaching and learning resources: rugs or benches for students and a blackboard with chalk for the teacher. Most students have a copy of the prescribed textbook. Some schools have resources such as globes, charts and books, which adorn the head teacher's office rather than being in the classroom.

In some government schools the head teachers, teachers and students compensate for lack of facilities. In one school particularly, self-help pervaded the ethos of the school as evident from the head teacher's comment:

*Although government schools have huge campuses and big playgrounds as compared to private schools, which are set up in houses, we don't have chairs, desks, dusters, or water facilities. We don't have any support staff to clean our classrooms...We only function because of our self-help concept. There are many things that we bring from home and we spend our own money to purchase. For example, until six*

*months ago, we didn't have washroom facilities. The girls had to go home to use the washrooms, which was extremely unsafe. Now we have made one ourselves, which is used by teachers and students. Similarly, curtains were bought by one of our teachers. We spend our personal money to buy students gifts. I use my own mobile phone for school calls, we dug a well to provide water for our students, we use our own vehicles in case of emergency in the school, and we serve guests refreshments from our own pockets. (RaHTint03/09/02)*

Most reviews of citizenship education do not identify physical infrastructure as important to citizenship education. However, in Pakistan lack of physical infrastructure and resources can have positive & negative consequences for citizenship rights and citizenship education. Lack of infrastructure such as a boundary wall and toilet facilities make parents reluctant to send girls to school for fear of their safety and girls reluctant to continue their schooling. Girls are thus denied their constitutional right to education and to the empowerment required to claim other rights. On the other hand, lack of resources stimulates the school community to act to promote the common good. This community feeling and active participation are important lessons in citizenship.

### **Organization and management**

Pakistani schools are organized hierarchically and managed authoritarily. In all schools, decisions are communicated down the hierarchy and results of implementation up the hierarchy. Those at the top expect obedient implementation of the decisions, evident in this head teacher's comment.

*When I want something for the school I write an application to the ADO (Assistant District Officer), the ADO then sends it to the DEO (District Education Officer). If they do it well and good, otherwise I leave it. We have to go through the proper channel. When they tell us to do something we have to do it. We have to obey them. (QHTint26/09/02)*

To ensure the smooth functioning of government schools teacher committees are formed. These ensure school cleanliness, discipline, timely completion of the syllabus, and conduct of co-curricular activities. Only in one private school serving a low –income population are teachers elected to the committees.

In 2001 the government devolved decision-making power to the school by establishing School Management Committees (SMCs). The aims, objectives and functions of the SMCs are to: increase enrolment and retention of students, especially girls; improve academic performance; provide incentives to teachers and needs-based teacher training; encourage community members to serve the school; generate and manage funds; and prepare and implement a school development plan. The SMC general body comprises all members of the union council, teachers, parents, and notables. The executive body is elected by the general body with a citizen from the community and the head teacher of the school as co-chairs (Education Department, 2001). The head teachers viewed the SMCs as fundraising bodies and sought membership of “important members of society... who are educated, willing to serve the school and financially in a better position than the parents”. The local councillor was an important member because he/she could

provide “money for fans, lights and furniture”. Discussing the role of the SMC a head teacher said

*I think their responsibility is to solve our problems. It means that parents in the SMC must be rich. If they are not rich then they must have so much authority that they can collect resources from somewhere else to help our school...It is the responsibility of the members to call meetings. At the meetings the school puts all the problems in front of them, as they have to solve them. They discuss them but they are not in a position to solve them as no one wants to do hard work. (QHTint29/09/02)*

Only in one government school did the head teacher see a larger role for the SMC.

*This body of parents is empowered to ensure teachers go to the class regularly, teach the prescribed curriculum and check students' test results (RaHTint03/0902)*

Three private schools had parent-teacher associations (PTAs). In two they were viewed as “simply a formality” as parents are “uneducated” (FHTint02). In one school a familial relationship existed between the parents and the school with parents being encouraged to volunteer there.

Democracy is best learned in democratic settings (Apple & Beane, 1995; Volk, 1998). Therefore, the essentially hierarchical authoritarian management of Pakistani schools must be made more democratic. The SMCs/PTAs are a way to democratize school management as they give communities an opportunity for involvement in the life of the school and a say in decision-making. If SMCs/PTAs are to serve their purpose they must be open to all community members so as to help break down class, creed and ethnic barriers. Members must be educated to play their role effectively. Ample opportunity must also be provided for members to participate in discussion and decision-making. This will help members develop new perspectives and maximize their communication and decision-making skills. It would also provide them an opportunity to fulfil their citizenship responsibility and serve as role models for the students.

### **Citizenship education in the classroom**

In all classrooms students sit two to three to a bench in rows facing the teacher. On most classroom walls there are religious pictures and messages alongside pictures of national heroes and national symbols. Classrooms in private schools also have children’s work displayed. They often had a clock and a calendar on the walls as well.

In most classrooms teaching follows the formula of read – explain – question. The teacher reads the lesson aloud from the textbook, explains it through a lecture, and asks students questions which require them to recall the facts just read. Here is an example of a lesson delivered in class five.

*T: Today we will study the culture of Pakistan. You read (pointing to a student)*

*S: (reading like a voice recording). Culture is the way of life of the people living in a particular geographic and social setting. Culture includes: the way people dress, the food they eat...(the teacher interrupted the student three times to correct her pronunciation. When she had read a paragraph the teacher called on another student to read)*

*S: There are various factors that influence the culture of a place. One factor is the physical features of a place. For example... (the teacher corrected the student four times)*

*T: The language our forefathers used is being used today.*

*S: (reads)...*

*T: OK children what is culture? (rhetorical question) Our geography, religion, dress, language, etc. are all included. We are Pakistanis, our language is Urdu. We speak Urdu. Since we are Muslims, Islam is our religion. We got Pakistan because the Muslims and Hindus could not live together. We wanted to live our lives according to Islam. Islam's principles influence us. Our clothes are simple, our food is simple... You tell me, what language do we speak?*

*Ss: Urdu (in chorus)*

*T: What is Urdu?*

*Ss: Our national language (in chorus)*

*T: We celebrate Independence Day just like we celebrate Eid. We go to different places, meet relatives... You go to different places. You go?*

*Ss: Yes (in chorus)*

(The rest of the lesson continued with the teacher explaining and asking questions) (QSobs22/08/02)

There are minor variations of the formula read-explain-question. For example, students read instead of the teacher; teachers' explanations include their beliefs and daily life experiences. Instead of oral questions teachers write questions and answers on the blackboard for students to copy (primary classes) or have students mark the answers in the textbook or dictate notes (secondary classes).

Teachers mainly in the private schools use discussion and group work. Discussions focused on recall of content and resembled recitation. The following extract of a discussion on the causes of the decline of the Mughals in the sub-continent is illustrative.

*T: You said the East India Company (EIC) came in before the Portuguese and Dutch. The moment the EIC was allowed to trade it sealed the subcontinent's fate. How did the EIC get lands?*

*S: Bought them.*

*S: Reforms.*

*T: Can you name them?*

*S: Doctrine of lapse.*

*T: Can you explain?*

*S: If no male heir property will be confiscated.*

*T: Why did the British not allow relatives?*

*S: Not natural successor.*

*T: What benefit?*

*S: In this way they could take over land.*

*T: Does anyone know when introduced?*

(The rest of the lesson continued in the same way) (FPAobs30/08/02)

Similarly observation revealed that “group work” consisted of putting students in a group to answer end-of-the-chapter questions followed by group presentations. In one classroom the teacher asked groups to “Give three reasons for trade and say why it is important”. The teacher went over to a few groups to ensure they were on-task but did not stay to observe how they worked. After five minutes groups presented. Following the presentations the teacher encouraged the class to ask questions. However, she did not clarify misconceptions, develop the shared or summarize the presentations.

In most classrooms teaching is transmission of knowledge and learning a passive process of listening to the teacher. Students generally participate only in reading and answering questions. But sometimes even this opportunity is denied. In a class as soon as the teacher told the students to open their texts, their hands shot up and they shouted “Miss, can I read?”, “Miss, can I read?” The teacher ignored the students’ requests and said harshly, “Nobody will say anything. Keep quiet!” and began reading. As she continued reading, despite the absolute silence in the classroom, she shouted, “No noise! Complete silence!”(RaNobs03/09/02). Only a few students are called on to answer questions and same question is put to three or four students to ensure the answer is learned.

The teacher reinforces him/herself as the classroom’s sole authority by maintaining strict discipline. Students are expected to obediently follow the teacher’s instructions. However, they were often observed defying instructions. The teacher stopped disobedient students by ordering them back to work and rapping the duster on the desk. Many teachers also used reward and punishment to maintain classroom discipline. Students who excel academically or behave well are made monitors whereas those who do not are scolded, deprived of rewards and occasionally beaten. Teachers appoint monitors to maintain discipline in their absence and monitors expect students to obey them. Elections of class monitors were held in only one school.

Teaching and learning in Pakistani classrooms is formulaic and boring as teachers transmit textbook knowledge and ensure its rote memorization. Minimal teacher-student interaction occurs, and even less is permitted amongst students. No citizenship skills are developed. Values, like knowledge, are transmitted through lectures rather than encouraging students to choose and develop their own. Such classrooms are not conducive to citizenship education.

Pakistani Educations are scathing in their criticism of teaching and learning in Pakistani classrooms. Aziz (1992) states “In Pakistan the textbooks of social studies is the only instrument of imparting education on all levels because the teacher(s) do not teach ... but repeat what it contains and the student is encouraged or simply ordered to memorize its contents” (p.1). He further observes that the teaching of social studies produces millions of educated slaves, not responsible citizens. Kizilbash (1986) agrees with Aziz, “The existing teaching practice is contributing to the socialization of obedient, passive citizens who lack critical thinking, questioning, decision-making and problem solving skills, who are closed minded followers rather than responsible and independent citizens.”

### **Citizenship education outside the classroom**

All schools begin the day with an assembly where verses from the Holy Qur’an and/or a prayer are recited and the national anthem is sung. Monitors check if

students are neat, clean and wearing the prescribed uniforms. Occasionally the head teacher or students give educational or moral messages. A head teacher said:

*In the morning we have a prayer at the assembly. It teaches them some good points. When the girls come late we ask them the reason. And whatever the reason they give I ask 'Don't you pray? And if you do, then you shouldn't be late as prayer teaches you to be punctual.' We also teach them moral values as we have to guide them. We tell them to wear a scarf (on their heads) as next door there is a boys school (GG HTint29/8/02)*

Most schools celebrate national days and Muslim religious festivals. Students also take part in interschool competitions. National days are celebrated each year. Students make speeches about the significance of the day, depict the event and sing national songs. Milads and naat khawni (act of reciting poetry in praise of Prophet Muhammad) are held to celebrate Eid-i-Milad-un-Nabi. No regular sports are held in school; only a few select students are coached to participate in interschool competitions. Similarly, a few students with melodious voices enter naat competitions.

In two government schools some students are girls guides. Becoming girl guides is a permissible way for girls to learn to help each other, solve daily life problems and learn about Pakistan. Initial girl guides training begins with oath taking and explanation of its importance. The girls are told the role of a patrol, divided into patrols, and the session ends with singing the national anthem. (GGfn29/8/02).

All private schools have student councils. Teachers select "active and intelligent students for the council." Only in one case were elections of the selected students held. A head teacher described the role of the student council.

*The role of the student council is to help in the arrangement of events, identify the needs of students and help to address them, and if students get hurt in the absence of a teacher the prefect must take them home or to a doctor (MEHTint02)*

However, the student councils have no decision-making role. In one school the students organized a bake sale, prepared and sold cakes, but were excluded from decisions regarding how to spend the money raised.

Only at one private school did students engage in community service: visiting sick children in a hospital and raising funds to buy equipment. This school had a number of clubs: Dramatic, Literacy and Sports. Members of the Literacy Club go on Saturdays to a Basti school to teach. There was, however, little preparation for, or reflection on, these activities.

To become effective citizens requires that young people learn a body of knowledge; develop relevant skills, values and dispositions; and obtain a first-hand experience of citizenship through participation in student councils, active engagement in community service, and involvement in social action that seeks to precipitate social change (Wade and Saxe 1996; Apple 1999; Khane and Westheimer 1996). In Pakistani schools students acquire a lot of information but do not know how to use it to take and defend positions on issues or solve problem. Some develop participatory skills through student council membership and community service. They learn values of respect for and service to others. However,

values useful for public life – such as civic-mindedness, critical consciousness and willingness to negotiate — are not developed.

### **Teachers' views about citizenship and citizenship education**

Teachers were unaware of any formal requirement to educate for citizenship but noted teaching content required by citizens in social studies, Islamiat and English language classrooms. Social studies teachers taught the structure and functions of the government, the constitution and the rights and duties of citizens. They also referred to teaching about shariah (Muslim law), need to help one another and disadvantages of conflict in Islamiat (RaNFint03/09/02) and to “teaching the last sermon of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) which promotes love, equality and human dignity” in English (RHGFint09/09/02). Only one social studies teacher in a private school felt that teaching course content was “inadequate for citizenship education”. She proposed all schools teach moral education, discuss social issues and have students participate in community service.

Besides teaching textbook content, teachers teach students Islamic, civic and moral values; serve as role models and moral guides. They lecture on the importance of personal and environmental cleanliness; the need to help the less fortunate; the importance of being modest and honest; respect for elders; and distinguishing between right and wrong. A teacher said, “I teach moral values, how to develop a good character, the need to be good to one another and to help their neighbours.” (MF06/09/02) Another teacher sees her role as “imparting knowledge but more important drilling in moral values.” She elaborated “I am basically a guide that enables them to become better human beings. I teach them what is right and what is wrong and explain to them the consequences of breaking rules.” (FPA30/08/02) Her aim is “to develop good Muslims and patriotic Pakistanis.” (FPA30/08/02)

Teachers, however, noted that they give little attention to citizenship education as they have to cover a lengthy syllabus and prepare students for examinations. Moreover, they felt that citizenship education should be the responsibility of every teacher so that there are tangible outcomes and that teachers be specially prepared to educate for citizenship.

The findings reveal that the approach to citizenship education in Pakistani schools is an education about citizenship combined with a values explicit approach. Teachers generally believe that the content in existing social studies textbooks is adequate and any deficiency is made up by teaching values so that students become good people and good Muslims. While this is certainly related to being a good citizen, teachers are remiss if they do not teach key concepts like democracy and human rights, develop democratic citizenship skills and prepare students to engage in social action to create a more just society.

Teaching and learning in the classroom is often in opposition to the outcomes desired of citizenship education. The dominant teaching strategy is transmission of textbook knowledge which encourages passive learning. Most teachers felt it was the only way, given the institutional imperatives of teaching a content-heavy curriculum, lack of resources and examinations. The teacher is the sole authority in the class and students have no choice in what or how to learn. Teachers do not realize that the focus on knowledge transmission and their authoritarian teaching style impedes students from playing their role as citizens of the class. Teachers must learn to take advantage of day-to-day opportunities for citizenship education such as holding elections for classroom monitors.

There is greater opportunity for citizenship education through co-curricular activities as they encourage participation and social responsibility. In most schools these opportunities are rare. Government schools should be encouraged to set up student councils. In all schools elections should be held for council membership and the work of the council enhanced so students gain experience in discussion, problem-solving, and teamwork. To involve more students schools should establish student clubs and organize community service learning programs. The number of clubs should be expanded to include clubs such as a Children's Right Watch Club and Environmental Club. Participation in framing the aims and objectives, engaging in activities to achieve the objectives, and evaluating the work done will prepare students for participation in civil society organizations, an important part of a democratic society.

### **ENLARGING POSSIBILITIES THROUGH TEACHER EDUCATION**

Essential to the reconceptualization of education for democratic citizenship is the teacher. However as citizenship education is integrated into social studies the focus must be on the social studies teacher. Teacher education programmes that prepare social studies teachers to educate for democratic citizenship must begin by engaging teachers in a critical reflection on teaching and learning in their classrooms, discussions of the purpose of education and their conceptions of citizenship and citizenship education. They must then help teachers envisage a democratic society and design a citizenship education programme to realize it.

To effectively implement a citizenship education program teachers must have the requisite knowledge, pedagogical skills and dispositions. This implies development of knowledge of the disciplines that comprise social studies and how to use them to educate for citizenship. In a context where only one teaching method is used, teachers must learn instructional strategies that require students active participation in learning, stimulate students to think and require students to work with and for each other. Teacher education programmes must also provide teachers opportunities to use their learnings in the real classrooms and facilitate critical reflection to improve practice.

Besides preparing teachers to teach for citizenship in the classroom, teacher education programmes must include ways to educate for citizenship through co-curricular activities such as celebration of local, national and international days, student councils, student clubs, and community service learning programmes. Teachers must learn the purpose of these activities and how to organize and facilitate students participation in them so that their benefits accrue to students.

Teacher education programmes must view as key the development of teachers' advocacy skills. As teachers work with students in schools they must also advocate for a more just, free and peaceful society. Teacher education programmes must help teachers recognize that advocacy efforts are strengthened when they collaboratively engage in them. Thus they must develop teachers' networks and partnerships-development skills. In addition, they must help teachers realize that change takes time, but persistence in advocating for change is rewarded.

In order to realize this vision teacher education programmes in Pakistan must combine education at the university with school-based training. Working with teachers in schools, teacher educators must demonstrate citizenship and work with teachers to plan, act and engage in collective self-reflective inquiry until democratic principles and practices are internalized. Mechanisms for follow-up to facilitate

teachers continuing professional development and their development as democratic citizens must also be seen as integral to the programme.

### **Conclusion**

This paper reports on two research studies that assessed the current status of democratic citizenship education in Pakistani schools. The study shows that the key focus of education in schools is the acquisition of factual knowledge and inculcation of Islamic, civil and moral values. It also shows that the organization and management of schools and most teaching and learning practices are not conducive to the preparation of democratic citizens.

Although democratic structures such as the teacher committees, students councils and SMCs exist, their functioning has to be made more democratic. The study revealed that while teaching and learning in the classroom is teacher-controlled there are a range of co-curricular activities that offer students opportunity for first hand experience of citizenship. The paper concludes with suggestions for teacher education programme that will enable teachers to envision a democratic society and educate students to realize the vision.

*Correspondence:* BERNADETTE L. DEAN, [Aga Khan University, Institute for Educational Development](#), IED-PDC, 1-5/B-VII, F.B. Area, Karimabad, P.O. Box 13688, Karachi-75950, Pakistan

## Appendix A

LEARNING COMPETENCIES FOR CLASS – V CHAPTER I ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN					
Objectives	Concepts	Contents	Activities	Learning Outcomes	Evaluation
<p><b>Cognitive</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Develop understanding of the Hindu Muslim differences and need for Pakistan.</li> <li>2. To get acquainted with the personalities who worked for the independence of Pakistan.</li> <li>3. To enhance understanding of the forces working against Pakistan.</li> <li>4. Create awareness about the freedom movement.</li> <li>5. Promote realization about the Kashmir issue and India role.</li> </ol> <p><b>Affective</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Develop a sense of fear for Allah.</li> <li>2. Enhance the feeling of patriotism, self-reliance, and service to humanity and devotion to Muslim Brotherhood.</li> <li>3. Develop the sense of preservation of the ideology, integrity and security of Pakistan.</li> </ol> <p><b>Psychomotor</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Tracing and filling in the map.</li> <li>2. Delivering speeches.</li> <li>3. Observation.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Ideology of Pakistan.</li> <li>2. Muslim Ummah.</li> <li>3. Two-nation theory.</li> <li>4. Struggle.</li> <li>5. Self-sacrifice.</li> <li>6. Self-reliance.</li> <li>7. Initiative.</li> <li>8. Jihad.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Hindu Muslim difference in cultures.</li> <li>2. Need for establishment of independent Muslim State.</li> <li>3. Ideology of Pakistan.</li> <li>4. India's evil designs against Pakistan (The three wars with India).</li> <li>5. Kashmir problem.</li> <li>6. Need for the security of Pakistan and Islam.</li> <li>7. Sustainable development of Pakistan on the basis of self-reliance.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Observe the outline of the map on which muslim majority provinces of Indo-Pak subcontinent before independence are drawn.</li> <li>2. Involvement in group discussions and listening to the talk on Pakistan Ideology and Kashmir Issue.</li> <li>3. To listen talks on the essential features of muslim culture.</li> <li>4. Visits to the places of historical importance.</li> <li>5. Collection of photographs and paste them on scrape book.</li> <li>6. Exhibition of the material made/collected by the students in the classrooms.</li> <li>7. Participation in congregational events.</li> <li>8. Reading of story books related to Indo-Pak History.</li> <li>9. To make speeches on Jihad.</li> <li>10. To listen to special programs broadcast on Muslim History and Culture.</li> <li>11. To make classroom neat and clean on self help basis.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Identify the events in relation to Hindu-Muslim differences, which laid the foundations for the Pakistan emergencies:-</li> <li>2. Define Ideology.</li> <li>3. Describe the meanings of Ideology.</li> <li>4. Identify the behaviour patterns for a Pakistani, which may preserve the ideology and improve the situation with reference to national Cohesion and State Integrity.</li> <li>5. Specify the nature of Kashmir issue.</li> <li>6. Discuss the role of present Government in re-establishing to sound position of Pakistan and freedom fighters before the international community.</li> <li>7. Evaluate the role of India with reference to wars of 1956, 1965 and 1971 A.D.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Observing the keenness of the pupils about the national programs.</li> <li>2. To note down the reaction of the pupils about wars with India.</li> <li>3. To judge their spirits while making speeches on Jihad.</li> <li>4. To note the attitude of the students about self help reliance.</li> <li>5. Testing of students' skills through objective type tests.</li> </ol>

Figure 1. Chapter 1, Social Studies Curriculum for class V (Government of Pakistan 2002, pp 31-32)

Appendix B

Class 1	Class 2	Class 3	Class 4	Class 5	Class 6
Home school mosque (physical environment)	Village Town city	The district	Province (location and history)	Islamic Republic of Pakistan (history)	Pakistan and South Asia: Location and physical features
Inmates	The people of the village, Town, city	Population	Population	Population	Population of South Asia
Safety and security	Safety			Safety	
Means of transport	Means of transport	Means of communication and transportation	Means of communication and transportation	Means of communication and transportation	
Important personalities	Important personalities	Important personalities	Important personalities	Important personalities who contributed towards the spread of Islam and the freedom movement	
	Resources	Agricultural resources	Resources	Resources	Resources of South Asia

Appendix C

**Textbooks Analysed**

Dean, B. L. et al (2001).

Social Studies for Class 3. Jamshoro. Pakistan: Sindh Textbook Board.

Social Studies for Class 4. Jamshoro. Pakistan: Sindh Textbook Board.

Social Studies for Class 5. Jamshoro. Pakistan: Sindh Textbook Board.

Victor, E. (1996).

Social Studies for Class 6. Jamshoro. Pakistan: Sindh Textbook Board.

Jafri, S.H.A. (1998).

Social Studies for Class 7. Jamshoro. Pakistan: Sindh Textbook Board.

Shaikh, M.H., Dhanani, M.R. & Siddiqui, S. (1998).

Social Studies for Class 8. Jamshoro. Pakistan: Sindh Textbook Board.

Ahmed, S.Q., Ahmed, Q.S., Shaikh, M.H., Zai, A.A. & Dhanani, R.A. (1998).

Pakistan Studies for Classes IX – X. Jamshoro. Pakistan: Sindh Textbook Board.

Rabbani, M.I. (1998).

Introduction to Pakistan Studies. Multan: Caravan Book House.

## REFERENCES

- AHMED, S.Q., AHMED, Q.S., SHAIKH, M.H., ZAI, A.A. AND DHANANI, R.A. (1998). *Pakistan Studies for Classes IX – X. Jamshoro. Pakistan: Sindh Textbook Board.*
- ALTHUSSER, L. (1972). *Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses.* In Cosin, B.R. (ed.). *Education Structure and Society.* Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 242-280.
- APPLE, M.W. (1999). *Power, Meaning and Identity: Essays in Critical Educational Studies.* New York: Peter Lang.
- APPLE, M.W. (1990). *Ideology and Curriculum.* New York and London: Routledge.
- APPLE, M.W. AND BEANE, J.A. (1995). *Democratic Schools.* Alexandria, Virginia: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.
- AZIZ K.K. (1992). *The Murder of the History of Pakistan.* Lahore: Vanguard.
- BOHMAN, J. (2005). *Critical theory.* <http://plato.standord.edu/archivespr2005/entries/critical-theory/7> Retrieved June 05, 2005
- COTTON, K. (2001). *Educating for Citizenship.* Northwest Regional Educational Laboratory, 1-35.
- CRESSWELL, (1997). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research.* London: Sage Publications.
- DAY, C. & SACHS, J. (2004). *Professionalism, performativity and empowerment: discourses in the politics, policies and purposes of continuing professional development.* In Day, C. & Judyth, S. (Eds). *International Handbook on the Continuing Professional Development of Teachers.* England: Open University Press, 3-32.
- DEAN, B.L. (2000). *Islam, democracy and social studies education: a quest for possibilities.* Unpublished Ph.D. thesis. Edmonton: University of Alberta.
- DENZIN, N.K. AND LINCOLN, Y.S. (2002) (Eds). *The Qualitative Inquiry Reader.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publication
- EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (2001). *School Management Committee.* Karachi: Government of Sindh
- ESACK, F. (1997). *Qur'an, Liberation and Pluralism.* Oxford: One World Publications.
- GRANT, C.A. AND SLEETER, C.E. (1991). *Race, Class, Gender, and Disability in Current Textbooks.* In Flinders, D.J. and Thornton, S.J. *The Curriculum Studies Reader.* London: Routledge, 279-301
- HABERMAS, J. (1972). *Knowledge and Human Interests.* Translated by J. Shapiro. London: Heinemann.
- HARDER, E.A. (1999). *Research Conversation and Narrative: A critical hermeneutic orientation in participation Inquiry* Praeger Publication Westport: Connecticut
- IQBAL, A.M. (1968). *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam.* Lahore: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf.
- KAHNE, J., AND WESTHEIMER, J. (1996). *In the Service of What? The Politics of Service Learning.* Phi Delta Kappan, 77(9), 593-599.
- KAZI, A.A. (1991). *Ethnonational Questions, Educational Reform and the Political Socialization in the Post-Cold War Era: Case of Pakistan.* Paper presented at the Oxford Conference on Educational Reform, Local and Educational Needs. University College, Oxford. September 3-6, 1991.
- KIZILBASH, H. H. (1986). *Pakistan's curriculum jungle: An analysis of the SAHE consultation on the undergraduate curriculum in Pakistan.* Karachi: SAHE Publication.
- KERR, D., MCCARTHY, S. AND SMITH, A. (2002). *Citizenship education in England, Ireland and Northern Ireland.* *European journal of education.* 37(2).
- MINISTRY OF EDUCATION (2002). *Social Studies Curriculum for classes I-V.* Islamabad: Government of Pakistan.
- MINISTRY OF EDUCATION (2002). *Social Studies Curriculum for classes VI-VIII.* Islamabad: Government of Pakistan.
- MINISTRY OF EDUCATION (1998). *National Education Policy (1998-2010).* Islamabad: Government of Pakistan.
- MINISTRY OF EDUCATION (1979). *National Education Policy and Implementation Programme.* Islamabad: Government of Pakistan.
- MINISTRY OF EDUCATION (1972). *The New Education Policy 1972-1980.* Islamabad: Government of Pakistan.
- MINISTRY OF EDUCATION (1959). *Report of the Commission on National Education.* Islamabad: Government of Pakistan.
- MINISTRY OF THE INTERIOR (Education Division) (1947). *Proceedings of the Pakistan Educational Conference.* Government of Pakistan.
- NAYYAR, A.H. AND SALIM, A. (2004). *The subtle subversion: The state of curricula and textbooks in Pakistan.* Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute.
- RAHMAN, F. (1406/1986). *The Principal of Shura and the Role of the Ummah in Islam.* In Mumtaz Ahmad (ed.). *State, Politics, and Islam.* Indianapolis: American Trust Publications, 90-91.
- SHAIKH, M.H., DHANANI, M.R. AND SIDDIQUI, S. (1998). *Social Studies for Class 8. Jamshoro. Pakistan: Sindh Textbook Board.*
- TORNEY-PURTA, J. AND AMADEO, J (1999). *Civic Education Across Countries: Twenty-four National Case Studies from the IEA Civil Education Project.* Amsterdam: IEA.

VOLK, S. (1998). *A Democratic Classroom*. Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann.

WADE, R.C., AND SAXE, D.W. (1996). Community Service-Learning in the Social Studies: Historical Roots, Empirical Evidence, Critical Issues. *Theory and Research in Social Education*, 24(4): 331-359.